# BEFORE THE MEDICAL BOARD OF CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the First Amended Accusation Against:

Francis R. Palmer III, M.D.

Case No. 800-2019-062048

Physician's & Surgeon's Certificate No. G 57473

Respondent.

# **DECISION**

The attached Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is hereby adopted as the Decision and Order of the Medical Board of California, Department of Consumer Affairs, State of California.

This Decision shall become effective at 5:00 p.m. on March 1, 2024.

IT IS SO ORDERED: February 1, 2024.

MEDICAL BOARD OF CALIFORNIA

Richard E. Thorp, Chair

Panel B

1	ROB BONTA									
2	Attorney General of California MATTHEW M. DAVIS									
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General JASON J. AHN									
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 253172									
	KAROLYN M. WESTFALL									
5	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 234540 600 West Broadway Suita 1800									
6	600 West Broadway, Suite 1800 San Diego, CA 92101									
7	P.O. Box 85266 San Diego, CA 92186-5266									
8	Telephone: (619) 738-9433 Facsimile: (619) 645-2061									
9	Attorneys for Complainant									
10										
11	BEFORE THE									
12	MEDICAL BOARD OF CALIFORNIA									
13	DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS STATE OF CALIFORNIA									
14		Case No. 800-2019-062048								
15	In the Matter of the First Amended Accusation Against:	OAH No. 2023020506								
16	FRANCIS R. PALMER, III, M.D.	STIPULATED SETTLEMENT AND								
17	624 10th St. Santa Monica, CA 90402-2820	DISCIPLINARY ORDER								
18										
19	Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 57473									
20	Respondent.									
21										
22	IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by and between the parties to the above-									
23	entitled proceedings that the following matters are true:									
24		<u>PARTIES</u>								
25	1. Reji Varghese (Complainant) is the Executive Director of the Medical Board of									
26	California (Board). He brought this action solely in his official capacity and is represented in this									
27	matter by Rob Bonta, Attorney General of the Sta	matter by Rob Bonta, Attorney General of the State of California, by Jason J. Ahn and Karolyn								
28	M. Westfall, Deputy Attorneys General.									
	1									
	STIPULATED SETTLEMENT AND DISCIPLINARY ORDER (800-2019-062048)									

- 2. Respondent Francis R. Palmer, III, M.D. (Respondent) is represented in this proceeding by attorney Peter J. Zomber, Esq., whose address is: 15332 Antioch Street, #708 Pacific Palisades, CA 90272.
- 3. On or about June 16, 1986, the Board issued Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 57473 to Respondent. The Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought in First Amended Accusation No. 800-2019-062048, and will expire on August 31, 2025, unless renewed.

# **JURISDICTION**

- 4. On February 13, 2023, First Amended Accusation No. 800-2019-062048, which superseded the Accusation filed on December 23, 2022, was filed before the Board, and is currently pending against Respondent. The First Amended Accusation and all other statutorily required documents were properly served on Respondent on or about February 13, 2023. Respondent timely filed his Notice of Defense contesting the Accusation.
- 5. A copy of First Amended Accusation No. 800-2019-062048 is attached hereto as Exhibit A and is incorporated herein by reference.

# **ADVISEMENT AND WAIVERS**

- 6. Respondent has carefully read, fully discussed with counsel, and understands the charges and allegations in First Amended Accusation No. 800-2019-062048. Respondent has also carefully read, fully discussed with his counsel, and fully understands the effects of this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order.
- 7. Respondent is fully aware of his legal rights in this matter, including the right to a hearing on the charges and allegations in the Accusation; the right to confront and cross-examine the witnesses against him; the right to present evidence and to testify on his own behalf; the right to the issuance of subpoenas to compel the attendance of witnesses and the production of documents; the right to reconsideration and court review of an adverse decision; and all other rights accorded by the California Administrative Procedure Act and other applicable laws.

28 || ///

///

8. Having the benefit of counsel, Respondent voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently waives and gives up each and every right set forth above.

### **CULPABILITY**

- 9. Respondent does not contest that, at an administrative hearing, Complainant could establish a *prima facie* case with respect to the charges and allegations contained in First Amended Accusation No. 800-2019-062048, a copy of which is attached hereto as Exhibit A, and that he has thereby subjected his Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 57473 to disciplinary action.
- 10. Respondent agrees that if an accusation is ever filed against him before the Medical Board of California, all of the charges and allegations contained in First Amended Accusation No. 800-2019-062048 shall be deemed true, correct, and fully admitted by Respondent for purposes of that proceeding or any other licensing proceeding involving Respondent in the State of California.
- 11. Respondent agrees that his Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 57473 is subject to discipline and he agrees to be bound by the Board's imposition of discipline as set forth in the Disciplinary Order below.

### **CONTINGENCY**

12. This stipulation shall be subject to approval by the Medical Board of California. Respondent understands and agrees that counsel for Complainant and the staff of the Medical Board of California may communicate directly with the Board regarding this stipulation and settlement, without notice to or participation by Respondent or his counsel. By signing the stipulation, Respondent understands and agrees that he may not withdraw his agreement or seek to rescind the stipulation prior to the time the Board considers and acts upon it. If the Board fails to adopt this stipulation as its Decision and Order, the Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order shall be of no force or effect, except for this paragraph, it shall be inadmissible in any legal action between the parties, and the Board shall not be disqualified from further action by having considered this matter.

///

# **ADDITIONAL PROVISIONS**

- 13. This Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is intended by the parties herein to be an integrated writing representing the complete, final, and exclusive embodiment of the agreements of the parties in the above-entitled matter.
- 14. The parties agree that copies of this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order, including copies of the signatures of the parties, may be used in lieu of original documents and signatures and, further, that such copies shall have the same force and effect as originals.
- 15. In consideration of the foregoing admissions and stipulations, the parties agree the Board may, without further notice to or opportunity to be heard by Respondent, issue and enter the following Disciplinary Order:

### **DISCIPLINARY ORDER**

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Respondent Francis R. Palmer, III, M.D., holder of Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 57473, shall be and hereby is Publicly Reprimanded pursuant to Business and Professions Code section 2227. This Public Reprimand, which is issued in connection with the allegation as set forth in First Amended Accusation No. 800-2019-062048, is as follows:

From November 2018 through May 2020, you aided and abetted the unlicensed practice of medicine and violated the ban on the corporate practice of medicine by engaging in a contractual relationship with a lay corporation (Orange Twist, LLC) that directly or indirectly controlled your medical practice at multiple Orange Twist med spa clinic locations throughout California, as more fully described in First Amended Accusation No. 800-2019-062048.

1. <u>EDUCATION COURSE</u>. Within 60 calendar days of the effective date of this Decision, Respondent shall submit to the Board or its designee for its prior approval educational program(s) or course(s) which shall not be less than 40 hours. The educational program(s) or course(s) shall be aimed at correcting any areas of deficient practice or knowledge and shall be Category I certified. The educational program(s) or course(s) shall be at Respondent's expense and shall be in addition to the Continuing Medical Education (CME) requirements for renewal of

licensure. Following the completion of each course, the Board or its designee may administer an examination to test Respondent's knowledge of the course. Respondent shall provide proof of attendance for 65 hours of CME of which 40 hours were in satisfaction of this condition.

2. PROFESSIONALISM PROGRAM (ETHICS COURSE). Within 60 calendar days of the effective date of this Decision, Respondent shall enroll in a professionalism program, that meets the requirements of Title 16, California Code of Regulations (CCR) section 1358.1. Respondent shall participate in and successfully complete that program. Respondent shall provide any information and documents that the program may deem pertinent. Respondent shall successfully complete the classroom component of the program not later than six (6) months after Respondent's initial enrollment, and the longitudinal component of the program not later than the time specified by the program, but no later than one (1) year after attending the classroom component. The professionalism program shall be at Respondent's expense and shall be in addition to the Continuing Medical Education (CME) requirements for renewal of licensure.

A professionalism program taken after the acts that gave rise to the charges in the Accusation, but prior to the effective date of the Decision may, in the sole discretion of the Board or its designee, be accepted towards the fulfillment of this condition if the program would have been approved by the Board or its designee had the program been taken after the effective date of this Decision.

Respondent shall submit a certification of successful completion to the Board or its designee not later than 15 calendar days after successfully completing the program or not later than 15 calendar days after the effective date of the Decision, whichever is later.

3. <u>INVESTIGATION/ENFORCEMENT COST RECOVERY</u>. Respondent is hereby ordered to reimburse the Board its costs of investigation and enforcement, in the amount of \$92,365.75 (ninety-two thousand three hundred sixty-five dollars and seventy-five cents). Costs shall be payable to the Medical Board of California. Failure to pay such costs shall constitute unprofessional conduct and grounds for further disciplinary action.

Payment must be made in full within 30 calendar days of the effective date of the Order, or by a payment plan approved by the Medical Board of California. Any and all requests for a

28

payment plan shall be submitted in writing by respondent to the Board. Failure to comply with the payment plan shall constitute unprofessional conduct and grounds for further disciplinary The filing of bankruptcy by respondent shall not relieve respondent of the responsibility to repay investigation and enforcement costs, including expert review costs. FUTURE ADMISSIONS CLAUSE. If Respondent should ever apply or reapply for a new license or certification, or petition for reinstatement of a license, by any other health care licensing action agency in the State of California, all of the charges and allegations contained in First Amended Accusation No. 800-2019-062048 shall be deemed to be true, correct, and admitted by Respondent for the purpose of any Statement of Issues or any other proceeding FAILURE TO COMPLY. Any failure by Respondent to comply with terms and conditions of the Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order set forth above shall constitute I have carefully read the above Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order and have fully discussed it with my attorney, Peter J. Zomber. I fully understand the stipulation and the effect it will have on my Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate. I enter into this Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently, and fully agree to be bound by the ince of feline Its prop FRANCIS R. PALMER, III, M.D. I have read and fully discussed with Respondent Francis R. Palmer, III, M.D., the terms and conditions and other matters contained in the above Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order. 12/13/2023

Attorney for Respondent

1	ENDORSEMENT									
2	The foregoing Stipulated Settlement and Disciplinary Order is hereby respectfully									
3	submitted for consideration by the Medical Board of California.									
4	DATED: 12/13/23 Respectfully submitted,									
5	ROB BONTA Attorney General of California									
6	Attorney General of California MATTHEW M. DAVIS Supervising Deputy Attorney General									
7 8	Cullestfall									
9	Jason J. Ahn Karolyn M. Westfall									
10	Deputy Attorneys General  Attorneys for Complainant									
11										
12										
13										
14	SD2022803140 84281295.docx									
15										
16										
17										
18										
19										
20										
21										
22										
23										
24										
25										
26										
27 28										
20	7									

STIPULATED SETTLEMENT AND DISCIPLINARY ORDER (800-2019-062048)

1	ROB BONTA											
2	Attorney General of California MATTHEW M. DAVIS Supervising Deputy Attorney General TESSA L. HEUNIS											
3												
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 241559 600 West Broadway, Suite 1800											
5	600 West Broadway, Suite 1800 San Diego, CA 92101											
6	P.O. Box 85266 San Diego, CA 92186-5266											
7	Telephone: (619) 738-9403 Facsimile: (619) 645-2061											
8	Attorneys for Complainant											
9.	DEFOR	הווצים הו										
10	BEFORE THE MEDICAL BOARD OF CALIFORNIA											
11	DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS STATE OF CALIFORNIA											
12		- <del></del>										
13	In the Matter of the First Amended Accusation Against:	Case No. 800-2019-062048										
14	FRANCIS R. PALMER, III, M.D.,	FIRST AMENDED ACCUSATION										
15	624 10 <sup>th</sup> St. Santa Monica, CA 90402-2820											
16	Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate											
17												
18	Respondent.											
19		•										
20	<u>PARTIES</u>											
21	1. Reji Varghese (Complainant) brings this Accusation solely in his official capacity as											
22	the Deputy Executive Director of the Medical Board of California, Department of Consumer											
23	Affairs (Board).											
24	2. On or about June 16, 1986, the Medical Board issued Physician's and Surgeon's											
25	Certificate No. G 57473 to Francis R. Palmer, III	M.D. (Respondent). The Physician's and										
26	Surgeon's Certificate was in full force and effect	at all times relevant to the charges brought										
.27	herein and will expire on August 31, 2023, unless	s renewed.										
28	1111											
	1											

### **JURISDICTION**

- 3. This First Amended Accusation, which supersedes Accusation No. 800-2019-058100 filed on December 23, 2022, is brought before the Board under the authority of the following laws. All section references are to the Business and Professions Code (Code) unless otherwise indicated.
  - 4. Section 2004 of the Code states:

The board shall have the responsibility for the following:

- (a) The enforcement of the disciplinary and criminal provisions of the Medical Practice Act.
  - (b) The administration and hearing of disciplinary actions.
- (c) Carrying out disciplinary actions appropriate to findings made by a panel or an administrative law judge.
- (d) Suspending, revoking, or otherwise limiting certificates after the conclusion of disciplinary actions.
- (e) Reviewing the quality of medical practice carried out by physician and surgeon certificate holders under the jurisdiction of the board.
- 5. Section 2220 of the Code states, in pertinent part:

Except as otherwise provided by law, the board may take action against all persons guilty of violating this chapter. The board shall enforce and administer this article as to physician and surgeon certificate holders, including those who hold certificates that do not permit them to practice medicine, such as, but not limited to, retired, inactive, or disabled status certificate holders, and the board shall have all the powers granted in this chapter for these purposes ...

- 6. Section 2227 of the Code states, in pertinent part:
- (a) A licensee whose matter has been heard by an administrative law judge of the Medical Quality Hearing Panel as designated in Section 11371 of the Government Code, or whose default has been entered, and who is found guilty, or who has entered into a stipulation for disciplinary action with the board, may, in accordance with the provisions of this chapter:
  - (1) Have his or her license revoked upon order of the board.
- (2) Have his or her right to practice suspended for a period not to exceed one year upon order of the board.
- (3) Be placed on probation and be required to pay the costs of probation monitoring upon order of the board.

Moscone-Knox Professional Corporation Act (Part 4 commencing with Section 13400) of Division 3 of Title 1 of the Corporations Code), or of any rules and regulations duly adopted under those laws.

# 11. Section 2285 of the Code states, in pertinent part:

The use of any fictitious, false, or assumed name, or any name other than his or her own by a licensee either alone, in conjunction with a partnership or group, or as the name of a professional corporation, in any public communication, advertisement, sign, or announcement of his or her practice without a fictitious-name permit obtained pursuant to Section 2415 constitutes unprofessional conduct. ...

### 12. Section 2051 of the Code states:

The physician's and surgeon's certificate authorizes the holder to use drugs or devices in or upon human beings and to sever or penetrate the tissues of human beings and to use any and all other methods in the treatment of diseases, injuries, deformities, and other physical and mental conditions.

# 13. Section 2400 of the Code states, in pertinent part:

Corporations and other artificial legal entities shall have no professional rights, privileges, or powers. ...

### 14. Section 2402 of the Code states, in pertinent part:

The provisions of Section 2400 do not apply to a medical ... corporation practicing pursuant to the Moscone-Knox Professional Corporation Act (Part 4 (commencing with Section 13400) of Division 3 of Title 1 of the Corporations Code) and this article, when such corporation is in compliance with the requirements of these statutes and all other statutes and regulations now or hereafter enacted or adopted pertaining to such corporations and the conduct of their affairs.

### 15. Section 2406 of the Code states, in pertinent part:

A medical corporation ... is a corporation that is authorized to render professional services, as defined in Section 13401 of the Corporations Code, so long as that corporation and its shareholders, officers, directors, and employees rendering professional services who are physicians and surgeons, psychologists, registered nurses, optometrists, podiatrists, chiropractors, acupuncturists, naturopathic doctors, physical therapists, occupational therapists, or, in the case of a medical corporation only, physician assistants, marriage and family therapists, clinical counselors, or clinical social workers, are in compliance with the Moscone-Knox Professional Corporation Act, the provisions of this article, and all other statutes and regulations now or hereafter enacted or adopted pertaining to the corporation and the conduct of its affairs.

With respect to a medical corporation ..., the governmental agency referred to in the Moscone-Knox Professional Corporation Act is the board.

# 16. Section 2410 of the Code states, in pertinent part:

A medical ... corporation shall not do or fail to do any act the doing of which or the failure to do which would constitute unprofessional conduct under any statute or regulation now or hereafter in effect. In the conduct of its practice, it shall observe and be bound by such statutes and regulations to the same extent as a licensee under this chapter [Chapter 5, the Medical Practice Act].

### 17. Section 2415 of the Code states, in pertinent part:

(a) Any physician and surgeon ... who as a sole proprietor, or in a partnership, group, or professional corporation, desires to practice under any name that would otherwise be a violation of Section 2285 may practice under that name if the proprietor, partnership, group, or corporation obtains and maintains in current status a fictitious-name permit issued by the Division of Licensing ... under the provisions of this section.

# 18. Section 650 of the Code states, in pertinent part:

- (a) Except as provided in Chapter 2.3 (commencing with Section 1400) of Division 2 of the Health and Safety Code, the offer, delivery, receipt, or acceptance by any person licensed under this division ... of any rebate, refund, commission, preference, patronage dividend, discount, or other consideration, whether in the form of money or otherwise, as compensation or inducement for referring patients, clients, or customers to any person, irrespective of any membership, proprietary interest, or coownership in or with any person to whom these patients, clients, or customers are referred is unlawful.
- (b) The payment or receipt of consideration for services other than the referral of patients that is based on a percentage of gross revenue or similar type of contractual arrangement shall not be unlawful if the consideration is commensurate with the value of the services furnished or with the fair rental value of any premises or equipment leased or provided by the recipient to the payer. ...

### 19. Section 13401 of the Corporations Code states, in pertinent part:

- (a) "Professional services" means any type of professional services that may be lawfully rendered only pursuant to a license, certification, or registration authorized by the Business and Professions Code ...
- (b) "Professional corporation" means a corporation organized under the General Corporation Law or pursuant to subdivision (b) of Section 13406 that is engaged in rendering professional services in a single profession ... pursuant to a certificate of registration issued by the governmental agency regulating the profession as herein provided and that in its practice or business designates itself as a professional or other corporation as may be required by statute. However, any professional corporation ... rendering professional services by persons duly licensed by the Medical Board of California ... shall not be required to obtain a certificate of registration in order to render those professional services.

(d) "Licensed person" means any natural person who is duly licensed under the provisions of the Business and Professions Code ... to render the same professional services as are or will be rendered by the professional corporation ... of which he or she is, or intends to become, an officer, director, shareholder, or employee.

20. Section 13408.5 of the Corporations Code states, in pertinent part:

A professional corporation shall not be formed so as to cause any violation of law, or any applicable rules and regulations, relating to fee splitting, kickbacks, or other similar practices by physicians and surgeons... A violation of any such provisions shall be grounds for the suspension or revocation of the certificate of registration of the professional corporation. ...

- 21. Section 13410 of the Corporations Code states, in pertinent part:
- (a) A professional corporation ... shall be subject to the applicable rules and regulations adopted by, and all the disciplinary provisions of the Business and Professions Code expressly governing the practice of the profession in this state, and to the powers of, the governmental agency regulating the profession in which such corporation is engaged. Nothing in this part shall affect or impair the disciplinary powers of any such governmental agency over licensed persons or any law, rule or regulation pertaining to the standards for professional conduct of licensed persons or to the professional relationship between any licensed person furnishing professional services and the person receiving such services.

### REGULATORY PROVISIONS

22. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 1343 states, in pertinent part:

A professional corporation shall comply with the following provisions:

- (a) The corporation is organized and exists pursuant to the general corporation law and is a professional corporation within the meaning of the Moscone-Knox Professional Corporations Act (Corporations Code Section 13400 et seq.).
- 23. California Code of Regulations, title 16, section 1344 states, in pertinent part:
- (a) Unless a fictitious name permit is obtained pursuant to Section 2415 of the code, the name of a professional corporation shall be restricted to the name or surname of one or more of the present prospective or former shareholders who are physicians or podiatrists, as the case may be, for a medical ... corporation.
- (b) When the applicant uses any fictitious, false or assumed name or any name other than the name or surname of one or more of the present, prospective or former shareholders, or any other words or names in addition to those of the shareholders, it shall obtain a permit pursuant to Section 2415 of the code. ...

### **COST RECOVERY**

27. Section 125.3 of the Code provides, in pertinent part, that the Board may request the administrative law judge to direct a licensee found to have committed a violation or violations of the licensing act to pay a sum not to exceed the reasonable costs of the investigation and enforcement of the case, with failure of the licensee to comply subjecting the license to not being renewed or reinstated. If a case settles, recovery of investigation and enforcement costs may be included in a stipulated settlement.

# **FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS**

- 28. A medical spa has been defined<sup>2</sup> as a hybrid between an aesthetic medical center and a day spa with four core elements: (1) the provision of non-invasive (i.e. non-surgical) aesthetic medical services; (2) under the general supervision of a licensed physician; (3) performed by trained, experienced and qualified practitioners; (4) with onsite supervision by a licensed healthcare professional.
- 29. OrangeTwist is a national network of "med spas," controlled by a network of 'OrangeTwist-brand' corporations. Since its incorporation in 2015, OrangeTwist has opened sixteen locations throughout California, Nevada, New Jersey, Texas and Washington.
- 30. Each OrangeTwist location has a "medical director" who is an independent contractor to a professional medical corporation, "Body Concepts by Orange Twist 1."
- 31. OrangeTwist locations in California are staffed by roughly one to three physician assistants, nurse practitioners and/or registered nurses, per location, along with other employees who do not have a medical license. At some locations, at times, the only medical provider is a registered nurse.
- 32. Registered nurses are not permitted to perform good faith examinations, while physician assistants and nurse practitioners may do so under the supervision of a physician and surgeon. All three categories of physician extenders require the supervision of a licensed physician and surgeon.

https://www.a10associates.com/defeating-industy-adverse-legislation/ (as of February 9, 2023)

- 33. Any person who diagnoses, treats, operates for, or prescribes for any ailment, blemish, deformity, disease, disfigurement, disorder, injury, or other physical or mental condition of any person, is practicing medicine and must do so within the bounds of their license.

  Treatments offered at OrangeTwist constitute the practice of medicine and include, but are not limited to: dermal fillers, neuromodulator treatments, Clear and Brilliant treatments, Vivace (microneedling, collagen induction) treatments, intramuscular injections, intravenous treatments, microneedling, Diolaze, Fractora, Lumecca, and hair restoration. These modalities alter or reshape normal structures of the body and are advertised to consumers as means to improve appearance, "self-care" or for some other "health" outcome.
- 34. Dermal fillers are gel-like substances injected under the skin. Dermal fillers are meant to create a smoother or fuller appearance, or both. The FDA regulates dermal fillers as medical devices.
- 35. Clear and Brilliant is a low-level diode 1140 nanometer laser that does very mild skin resurfacing. Diolaze is a laser treatment that uses a diode laser beam to direct high-energy light to hair follicles, destroying the hair. Lumecca is a very powerful intense pulsed light (IPL) that treats pigmented and vascular lesions. In California, physicians may use lasers or intense pulse light devices. In addition, physician assistants and registered nurses may perform these treatments under a physician's supervision.
- 36. Botox (anabotulinumtoxinA) is a neuromodulator used as an injection to reduce frown lines, crow's feet and forehead lines. Dysport (abotulinumtoxinA) is a neuromodulator used as an injection to reduce frown lines. In California, only licensed physicians may inject neuromodulators without supervision by another professional. Registered nurses (including nurse practitioners) and physician assistants may inject Botox under the supervision or direction of a licensed physician.
- 37. Microneedling is a minimally invasive procedure for your skin. Thin needles are used to make tiny holes in the top layer of the skin. The damage helps stimulate the skin's healing process, so it produces more collagen and elastin. Vivace is a form of microneedling that combines microneedling and radiofrequency energy to stimulate collagen production. Fractora is

radiofrequency microneedling. Only licensed physicians may do microneedling without supervision by another professional. Registered nurses (including nurse practitioners) and physician assistants perform microneedling under the supervision or direction of a licensed physician.

- 38. Before receiving any medical procedure or intervention, patients must be competent to make a voluntary decision about whether to undergo the procedure or intervention, otherwise known as "informed consent." Patients need to be educated about the nature of the procedure, the attendant risks and benefits of the procedure, and reasonable alternatives to the procedure by someone sufficiently knowledgeable and qualified to do so. Informed consent is both an ethical and legal obligation of medical practitioners in California.
- 39. The Board provides<sup>3</sup> the following guidance to its licensees regarding the corporate practice of medicine:

... [T]he following "business" or "management" decisions and activities, resulting in control over the physician's practice of medicine, should be made by a licensed California physician and not by an unlicensed person or entity:

- Ownership is an indicator of control of a patient's medical records, including determining the contents thereof, and should be retained by a California-licensed physician;
- Selection, hiring/firing (as it relates to clinical competency or proficiency) of physicians, allied health staff and medical assistants;
- Setting the parameters under which the physician will enter into contractual relationships with third-party payers;
- Decisions regarding coding and billing procedures for patient care services; and
- Approving of the selection of medical equipment and medical supplies for the medical practice.

The types of decisions and activities described above cannot be delegated to an unlicensed person, including (for example) management service organizations. While a physician may consult with unlicensed persons in making the "business" or "management" decisions described above, the physician must retain the ultimate responsibility for, or approval of, those decisions.

The following types of medical practice ownership and operating structures also are prohibited:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> https://www.mbc.ca.gov/Licensing/Physicians-and-Surgeons/Practice-Information/ (as at February 9, 2023)

• Non-physicians owning or operating a business that offers patient evaluation, diagnosis, care and/or treatment;

...

- Management service organizations arranging for, advertising, or providing medical services rather than only providing administrative staff and services for a physician's medical practice (non-physician exercising controls over a physician's medical practice, even where physicians own and operate the business); and
- A physician acting as "medical director" when the physician does not own the practice. For example, a business offering spa treatments that include medical procedures such as Botox injections, laser hair removal, and medical microdermabrasion, that contracts with or hires a physician as its "medical director."

In the examples above, non-physicians would be engaged in the unlicensed practice of medicine, and the physician may be aiding and abetting the unlicensed practice of medicine.

40. Regarding medical spas, the Board<sup>4</sup> offers the following:

Medical spas are marketing vehicles for medical procedures. If they are offering medical procedures, they must be owned by physicians.

41. In this case, Respondent and a lay corporation contrived to make it appear that Respondent was "the licensed owner[] of a medical spa" and that the lay corporation was purely offering "key business management services" to him. In reality, Respondent owned nothing – the lay corporation owned and controlled the medical equipment, the practice premises and their lease(s), the corporate trademark under which the medical practice was required to do business, and all of the multiple bank accounts that were opened in the name of the practice (but operated exclusively by the lay corporation). Of note, profit motivations in such arrangements subjugate consumer safety.<sup>5</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> https://www.mbc.ca.gov/Resources/Medical-Resources/Medical-Spas.aspx (as of February 9, 2023)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> The American Med Spa Association ("AmSpa") is a for-profit LLC whose mission is to "help its members ... operate both legally and profitably." It was founded by an attorney at a Dallas-based law firm who "identified the need for an organization that focused on the legal and compliance issues of the newly evolving medical spa and medical aesthetic industry." The Dallas-based law firm reportedly "powers" the legal resources provided by AmSpa. One of the attorneys associated with the Dallas-based firm is RF, Esq. An AmSpa blog entitled "Who Can Own a Medical Spa," provides the following information to would be investors: "... [M]edical spas primarily offer medical treatments. Accordingly, most states regulate medical spas in the same way they do other medical practices. ... [I]t is the licenses of the health care providers who work in the medical spa that allow it to offer its services. The main qualification a person needs to own a medical spa is having the proper qualification that allows them to own a medical practice and employ health care personnel. ... Many states prohibit non-physicians from owning

42. The business model Respondent adopted poses multiple threats to patients, including: the lay corporation may not understand the quality of care implications of their business decisions, the lay corporation does not have any professional ethical obligation to place the patient's interests foremost, and the lay corporation is not subject to the full panoply of healthcare regulation and enforcement powers of the Board.

Incorporation of OrangeTwist and Body Concepts By OrangeTwist 1 Corp.: 6

- 43. OrangeTwist was co-founded by Medical Director W. Grant Stevens, M.D. ("Dr. Stevens") and Clint Carnell, <sup>7</sup> a person who does not have a medical license.
- 44. On or about March 3, 2015, Orange Twist, LLC incorporated in Delaware ("OrangeTwist Delaware") and registered with the California Secretary of State ("CA SOS") as a Foreign LLC using the name "Orange Twist, LLC." Both filings were signed by Clint Carnell.
- 45. Also on or about March 3, 2015, a Management Services Agreement ("MSA") was entered into between OrangeTwist Delaware and a "practice" providing "medical services ... under the OrangeTwist name..."
- 46. On or about March 9, 2015, Body Concepts by Orange Twist 1 Corp. ("BCOT1") was incorporated in California. BCOT1 issued 10,000 shares (with a value of \$0.001 per share)

medical practices or from employing physicians. In these states, only a physician may own a medical practice or medical spa. Among lawyers, this is referred to as the "corporate practice of medicine" doctrine, ... Let's assume that you do not fall into one of the categories discussed above regarding who can own a medical spa; this is the case for the vast majority of people. But you want to open a medical spa—are you completely out of luck in terms of owning? Yes and no. ... [Y]ou cannot directly own an aesthetic medical practice. But ... you can still participate in the business and day-to-day management of an aesthetic practice. This involves using a business structure referred to as a management services organization (MSO). ... [T]o briefly explain, while you cannot own a medical business, you can own a business that provides key business management services and offer them to the licensed owners of a medical spa ... https://americanmedspa.org/blog/who-can-own-a-medical-spa (Post dated November 22, 2021, as at February 9, 2023.)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Conduct occurring more than seven (7) years from the filing date of this Accusation is for informational purposes only and is not alleged as a basis for disciplinary action.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> In an interview with the Board during its investigation of this matter ("the Board interview"), Respondent said that Dr. Stevens had "put this together along with the founders of OrangeTwist," Clint Carnell and Denise Keeler. According to Respondent, Clint Carnell had been "talking about starting something like this up ... back in 2009, 2010..."

to its sole shareholder, Grant Stevens, M.D. ("Dr. Stevens"), whose address was 485 E 17th St., Ste 500, Costa Mesa, California.

- 47. In or after April 2015, an application was filed with City of Costa Mesa for a business license tax certificate for BCOT1. The license was issued effective May 1, 20158 with a recorded mailing address of 485 17<sup>th</sup> St., Ste 500, Costa Mesa, for the attention of Gary Fischer.<sup>9</sup>
- On or about July 27, 2015, BCOT1 (through its then President, Grant Stevens, M.D.) amended its articles of incorporation to indicate that the entity was a California professional medical corporation.
- 49. On or about February 23, 2017, BCOT1 and/or Dr. Stevens applied to the Board for a Fictitious Name Permit ("FNP") to be issued in the name of "OrangeTwist." The address of record for the FNP was given as 485 E. 17th St., Costa Mesa. OrangeTwist FNP No. 547154 was issued on or about April 21, 2017. The contact person for the FNP was RF., Esq. (Dallas).
- FNP 54714 expired on or about April 30, 2019, and was delinquent until its renewal on or about January 30, 2020. At the same time as the renewal, the address of record for FNP 54714 was changed to 730 S. Allied Way Ste C, El Segundo, California. An email of record was provided as gary@orangetwist.com, and the phone contact number provided was the cell phone of Mr. Fischer.
- On or about March 7, 2017, RF, Esq., submitted a Statement of Information for BCOT1, describing the business of the corporation as "aesthetic medical procedures."
- When Dr. Stevens became too busy, Clint Carnell approached Respondent and asked whether Respondent would consider taking over from Dr. Stevens as the medical director for two branches of OrangeTwist. Thus, effective September 1, 2018, Respondent became a Medical Director of two (2) BCOT1 medical offices, at the OrangeTwist locations in Westlake Village and 730 S Allied Way, Suite C, El Segundo, California, respectively.

1111

26

27

28

24

25

<sup>8</sup> BCOT1's business license tax certificate in Costa Mesa expired on April 30, 2020, and the OrangeTwist branch in Costa Mesa was closed down at some earlier time.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Mr. Fischer is a former Chief Financial Officer for OrangeTwist.

- 53. Effective November 1, 2018, Respondent became the sole owner and CEO of BCOT1 and his purported purchase of Dr. Stevens' 10,000 shares in BCOT1 at their original total value of ten dollars (\$10).
- 54. As an independent contractor to BCOT1, Respondent received compensation of \$1,500 per month, per practice location. For his new role as Chief Medical Director for OrangeTwist, Respondent was paid an additional \$6,250 per month.
- 55. Also effective November 1, 2018, in his new dual roles as both CEO of BCOT1 and independent contractor to BCOT1, Respondent entered into an "Amended and Restated Medical Director Agreement" with BCOT1 (whose principal office is reported as being in Costa Mesa). The new agreement, while substantially similar to the former Medical Director Agreement, also provided that Respondent had entered into a "Consulting Agreement with Orange Twist, LLC, a Delaware limited liability company." <sup>10</sup>
- 56. On or about March 6, 2019, RF, Esq., submitted Statements of Information for both BCOT1 and OrangeTwist Delaware, respectively, with the CA SOS. The companies shared the same business address in Costa Mesa, California. While BCOT1's type of business was given as "medical spa," OrangeTwist Delaware reportedly engaged in "medical spa management." Its Chief Executive Officer was Clint Carnell.<sup>11</sup>

# OrangeTwist Expansion and Acquisitions/Mergers:

57. In late 2017 through 2018, a similar "management services" relationship existed in regard to the "Illuminate Face & Body Bar" med spas, which operated out of five (5) locations in California and one in Nevada. Thus, MSA's existed between the Illuminate "Manager" (an LLC, in each case) and the Illuminate "PC" (a professional medical corporation, in each case). The Illuminate lay corporations (one for each med spa location) were headed by co-trustees Jeffrey Seery and Kenneth Kay, while the owner of the Illuminate professional medical corporations was OF, M.D.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> At the Board interview, Respondent explained that BCOT1 "had a consulting agreement to provide medical oversight to the admin, which is OrangeTwist…"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> A similar form was submitted by RF, Esq., for OrangeTwist Delaware, on or about September 29, 2020, with the type of business described as "aesthetic medical procedures."

58. In 1	late 2018 and/or early 2019, without consultation with OF, M.D., OrangeTwist
merged with an	nd/or acquired the Illuminate LLC's, and the former "Illuminate" medi spa
locations were	turned into "OrangeTwist" medi spa locations. The MSA's between the
Illuminate LLC	C's and Illuminate PC's were terminated and the Illuminate medical practices run
by OF, M.D., w	vere effectively forced to close.

- 59. On or about March 15, 2019, OrangeTwist Delaware changed its name to OT Global, LLC. 12
- 60. On or about April 18, 2019, "Orange Twist, LLC," was incorporated in Nevada. The managers include both Clint Carnell and Jeffrey Seery. Clint Carnell's address is shown as 485 E 17<sup>th</sup> Street, Ste 500, Costa Mesa.
- 61. On or about April 30, 2019, OrangeTwist announced its 'anticipated merger" with Illuminate Face & Body Bar. Press announcements included the following:

"When I founded Illuminate, I envisioned a wellness concept that combined medical innovation and natural beauty to bring clients long-lasting results and confidence," noted Jeff Seery, Co-Founder and CEO of Illuminate Face & Body Bar. "With this merger, we can continue to expand this concept nationwide." <sup>13</sup>

In another report <sup>14</sup> of the announced "anticipated merger," the following appears:

"I met Jeff Seery, the founder, and CEO of Illuminate, and we have a very common vision," says Clint Carnell, OrangeTwist's founder .... "As we started looking to scale the OrangeTwist business, it was a natural fit."

Carnell mentions each location's interiors, designed for the best possible treatment environment amid the comfort of a relaxing, high-end setting. He also notes the alignment in staffing—both Illuminate and OrangeTwist seek out passionate practitioners who are devoted to customer health, safety, and a positive experience.

"If you're an Illuminate client, don't worry—you'll still have access to your favorite aestheticians, nurse practitioners, treatments and products. You'll also have

<sup>12</sup> On or about October 5, 2020, OrangeTwist Delaware similarly changed the name it used in California, from "Orange Twist, LLC" to "OT Global, LLC." On the same date, OrangeTwist, LLC, (aka OrangeTwist Nevada) registered with the CA SOS as a Foreign Limited Liability Company. The business address was indicated as 730 S. Allied Way, Suite C, El Segundo, CA 90245, and the form was signed on behalf of OrangeTwist, LLC by RF, Esq.

<sup>13</sup> https://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/orangetwist-announces-anticipated-merger-with-illuminate-face--body-bar-300840586.html (Post dated April 30, 2019, as at February 9, 2023.)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> https://orangetwist.com/orangetwist-illuminate/ (as at February 9, 2023)

more locations for your convenience, and OrangeTwist will honor any existing Illuminate365 monthly memberships and pre-paid services," Seery says. ...

Jeff Seery will remain as an executive with OrangeTwist... OrangeTwist co-founder, W. Grant Stevens, M.D., ... will remain Chief Medical Officer of the organization. Joining him at the organization will be Francis R. Palmer III, M.D... All Illuminate Face & Body Bar locations will be fully branded as OrangeTwist locations by July 2019.

"OrangeTwist was already one of the fastest-growing brands in the United States," Carnell says. "The expansion of our footprint just makes us more convenient for more clients, and it allows us to put more resources back into our products and services. If you're not growing, you're dying, so I'm just really fortunate to have met Jeff and to have found a partner who wants to work to make this one of the preeminent brands in the country. ... We are really excited about the future and look forward to putting the new company together and continuing to lead California aesthetics."

Neither report mentioned any participation in the merger by OF, M.D., or Illuminate Medical corporation.

- 62. Also in or around late 2018, the Pure Aesthetics and Wellness med spa operated in Newport Coast. A MSA existed between a lay corporation owned by Tom Forbath (DBA Pure Aesthetics and Wellness), and a professional medical corporation, the Pure Aesthetics and Wellness Medical Group (purportedly owned by TP, M.D.).
- 63. On or about May 17, 2019, both the DBA Pure Aesthetics and the medical corporation Pure Aesthetics were sold, in a single or simultaneous transaction(s), to OrangeTwist and BCOT1, respectively. As part of the sale of Pure Aesthetics to OrangeTwist, Mr. Forbath received a 40 percent ownership interest in a new OrangeTwist/Pure entity. Neither TP, M.D., nor the Pure Aesthetics medical corporation 15 received any compensation.
- 64. Pursuant to the sale agreement, all Pure Aesthetics' patient records were to be transferred to BCOT1. Further, the sale agreement, which was also signed by Respondent as a purchaser, included the following:

Purchasers<sup>16</sup> [including BCOT1] recognize ... that it may be in Purchasers' best interest to provide minor adjustments to patients' prior treatments to ensure the transfer of goodwill associated with such patients. Notwithstanding anything to the contrary, Purchasers will have no responsibility or liability to Sellers or any patient to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Pure Aesthetics, the medical corporation, was dissolved on December 29, 2020, and reportedly "never incurred any known debts or liabilities."

 $<sup>^{16}</sup>$  "Purchasers" are "Orange Twist Pure Management, LLC" and BCOT1.

provide any adjustment, repair, or replacement for any of Seller's Treatments, and Purchasers, in their sole discretion, may decline the right to treat any of Seller's former patients.

65. On or about June 2019, OrangeTwist announced the acquisition of Pure Aesthetics and Wellness. One report offers the following: 17

With this acquisition, OrangeTwist will now have a 15-center footprint across California, Nevada, Texas and Washington. All centers will look and operate as an OrangeTwist shop, including offering the existing curated menu of services, with the addition of IV therapy and wellness vitamin shots to help clients achieve results that allow them to look and feel their best from the inside out.

"At PURE Aesthetics + Wellness, we are committed to working closely with all of our clients to determine their specific needs and adapting each service or treatment accordingly for a personalized approach that guarantees these needs are safely and effectively met," said Tom Forbath, President of PURE Aesthetics + Wellness. "With the acquisition, this approach will be expanded to reach new clients that are specifically interested in these type of offerings in the wellness space."

- 66. Effective May 29, 2019, Respondent (as CEO of BCOT1) entered into an "Amended and Restated Management Services Agreement" ("2019 MSA") with OrangeTwist, LLC ("OrangeTwist").
- 67. By its terms, the 2019 MSA gives OrangeTwist control over BCOT1's medical practice in multiple ways, either directly or indirectly. BCOT1 has no rights to determine where it practices, and it has no control or authority over the medical equipment it uses, the name it practices under, or its bookkeeping and own bank accounts. OrangeTwist can terminate the 2019 MSA without cause, effectively causing the closure of BCOT1's medical practice, without any liability to BCOT1's patients.

# OrangeTwist / BCOT1 New Management Services Agreement:

68. The 2019 MSA provides the contractual relationship between "Manager" (OrangeTwist, represented by Clint Carnell) and "Practice" (BCOT1, represented by Respondent), whereby OrangeTwist provides management and administrative functions to BCOT1, <sup>18</sup> including billing, collections, accounting, finding real estate locations, subletting to

<sup>17</sup> https://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/orangetwist-announces-acquisition-of-pure-aesthetics--wellness-300871136.html (Post dated June 20, 2019, as of February 9, 2023)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> The 2019 MSA states, in its Recitals, that "Practice is engaged in the practice of

3

7

9

12

13 14

> 15 16

17

18

19 20

21

2223

24

25

26 27

28

BCOT1, the use of the OrangeTwist name and trademarks, and other non-medical services. At each clinic location, OrangeTwist serves as the tenant and subleases the space to BCOT1.<sup>19</sup>

69. The 2019 MSA shows that OrangeTwist is a separate business entity rather than merely providing an administrative service to BCOT1. For instance, OrangeTwist's protected "Proprietary Information" is defined as:

[A]ny and all (1) operating manuals, symbols, Trademarks, trade names, service marks, designs, contracts, vendor and supplier lists, procedures, protocols, processes, systems, records and files respecting services provided and to be provided to Practice, provider lists and fee schedules, vendor price lists, third-party payor payment rates, outside provider information, provider contracting information, and documentation relating to the provision of services performed under this Agreement; (2) photographs, books, publications, records, correspondence, notes, letters, documents, plan, proposed plans, manuals, forms; or any other material, files or data, including ledger cards, bookkeeping records, computer programs, and all other records or files of, affecting, or relating to the business of Manager; (3) inventions, discoveries, formulae, processes, products, designs, literary works, programs or other written material or documents conceived or developed by a Manager alone or in conjunction with others related to the subject matter of the Manager's business; (4) Manager's unique skills, concepts, sales presentations, marketing programs, marketing strategy, business practices, methods of operation, licenses, technical information, computer software, financial and other information concerning the Manager's operations and expansion plans, and any tapes, discs, or other storage medium with information concerning the Manager's operations, systems, hiring or training methods; and (5) all memoranda, notes, records, drawings, documents, computer software programs, tapes and discs, or other writings whatsoever made, compiled, acquired, or received in connection with, or related to any activity or business of Manager, including the Manager's suppliers, vendors, or others with whom Manager has a business relationship, Manager's arrangements with such parties, and Manager pricing and expansion policies and strategy. (Appendix A, paragraph (hh))

70. The 2019 MSA gives OrangeTwist direct and indirect control and/or influence over the medical practice, making decisions which bear directly and indirectly on the practice of medicine, including by diminishing physician independence, establishing the terms of employment and the physicians' rate of pay, influencing advertising, and vetting medical providers. OrangeTwist negotiates the medical practice's contracts with third-party payors, it

medicine ... and is owned solely by a physician..." The party who bound "Practice" to the contract is BCOT1/Respondent. In the definitions section, however, "Practice" is "the medical services provided under the OrangeTwist name by [BCOT1]..." In this pleading, "Practice" and "BCOT1" are used interchangeably, as are "Practice" and "OrangeTwist," with their true meanings to be determined by reference to the relevant section of the 2019 MSA.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> At one location (within Sephora), OrangeTwist leases space within Sephora which is then subleased to BCOT1.

requires physicians to assign their rights to the proceeds of their medical billings to OrangeTwist who decides how accounts will be settled in the event of disputes, and determines which charges to write off, among others.

### Control Over Medical Records and Protected Health Information

- 71. "Business records" is defined as "all records relating to the operation of Practice excluding all patient medical records and patient files and other records or documents which relate to patient treatment <u>by physicians</u>." (Emphasis added; Appendix A, paragraph (b).) Since "physician extenders" are separately defined and almost all the medical treatments are performed by "physician extenders," this effectively means that OrangeTwist maintains control over almost all patient medical records.
- 72. OrangeTwist is responsible for the maintenance, storage, retention, and custody of medical records of the Practice, "subject to Practice's oversight and ultimate authority and subject to strict compliance with the requirements of HIPAA and state law." (Art. 1.04.) When the 2019 MSA ends, Practice will retain all patient medical records and patient files maintained by Practice. (Emphasis added; Appendix B, paragraph (a).)
- 73. OrangeTwist is given broad power to use and/or disclose Protected Health Information ("PHI"), including "for the proper management and administration of [OrangeTwist]," provided the disclosures are either required by law or OrangeTwist has obtained "reasonable assurances" from the person to whom the PHI is disclosed that it will remain confidential and used or further disclosed only as required by law or for the purpose for which it was disclosed to the person. (Appendix C, art. 1.01.) But "a breach of this confidentiality [by OrangeTwist] is not a default under this Agreement." (Appendix B, paragraph (a).)

# Control and Authority over the Business and its Facilities

- 74. OrangeTwist is appointed as the exclusive manager of BCOT1 and is given exclusive control to manage the practice at all of its locations. BCOT1 may not assign the MSA or any of its obligations under the MSA without the prior written consent of OrangeTwist. (Art. 9.01.)
- 75. OrangeTwist may terminate the Agreement without cause upon at least 90 days prior written notice to BCOT1. (Article 6.03(c).) BCOT1 does not have a reciprocal right.

	76.	В	COT1	is requ	uired	to sublea	se its	practice	premises	from	OrangeT	wist on	prescri	ibec
terms	as	inclu	ded in	the M	SA.	(Appendi	x. B.	clause (	d).)					

- 77. OrangeTwist has "the right at all times to have access to Practice facilities for the purposes of performing its responsibilities under this Agreement, or for any reasonable purpose." (Art. 1.01.) If BCOT1 prevents Manager's access to the medical facilities, OrangeTwist may immediately terminate the 2019 MSA, cease providing all services and terminate any other agreements between the parties. (Article 2.06.)
- 78. If the 2019 MSA is terminated, the subleases will automatically terminate, without any liability of OrangeTwist to BCOT1. (Schedule B(d), clause 4.) Similarly, if tenant OrangeTwist's own lease(s) should terminate for any reason, BCOT1's sublease would automatically terminate, without liability of OrangeTwist to BCOT1. (Schedule B(d), clause 4.)
- 79. BCOT1 may not assign or further sublet any part of the premises without the consent of OrangeTwist. (Schedule B(d), clauses 8, 9.)
- 80. BCOT1 is required to grant an "exclusive special power of attorney" to OrangeTwist, giving OrangeTwist wide powers that include obtaining and taking possession of all mail addressed to "Practice" and signing on BCOT1's behalf for any accountable piece of mail, and "to exercise dominion over any mail piece of [BCOT1] ..." (Appendix D.)
- 81. Services provided to patients were part of OrangeTwist's business model.

  Control and Authority over How the Practice is Advertised and Marketed
- 82. The medical services at OrangeTwist were ostensibly provided by BCOT1, but BCOT1 was not permitted to market, advertise, or otherwise operate its business under any name or trademark(s) other than OrangeTwist's trademark.

... Manager grants to Practice a limited, nonexclusive, nontransferable license to use Manager's Trademark "OrangeTwist" and the OrangeTwist Materials in ... the operation of Practice's operations including the use of "OrangeTwist" in Practice's assumed name at Practice's physical locations identified [in] this agreement. In partial consideration of Manager's grant of the foregoing rights, Practice covenants with Manager that Practice will not market, advertise, or otherwise operate its business under any name or Trademark(s) other than Manager's Trademark during the Term unless otherwise required by law. (Schedule B(m), art. 1.01.)

28 | ////

- 83. Patients would not know of the existence of BCOT1 when seeking care at OrangeTwist locations, nor would they know that Respondent was or had been its Chief Medical Director.
- 84. BCOT1 has no rights in OrangeTwist's licensed materials, which are owned by OrangeTwist. Upon termination of the 2019 MSA for any reason, BCOT1 may no longer use the OrangeTwist trade name and must vacate OrangeTwist premises. (Schedule B(m), para. 1.05.).
- 85. OrangeTwist had significant input authority on all advertising and marketing of the Practice/BCOT1, under the name of OrangeTwist.

Subject to Practice's oversight and ultimate authority, Manager will, following consultation with Practice, develop marketing and advertising programs for Practice; provide advice and assistance to Practice on overall marketing programs, and determine and analyze the effect of such programs; plan, create, write and prepare advertising materials; negotiate contracts with advertising media for space and time; and obtain services necessary in connection with the production and presentation of advertisements. Notwithstanding anything to the contrary, Practice must make all final decisions relating to marketing and advertising materials. (Appendix B, paragraph (f).)

The Practice will have approval authority over ... content of any advertising subject to [] Section 651 of the California Business and Professions Code. (Art. 2.01(c).)

86. OrangeTwist markets itself and the medical services offered at its locations on the website www.orangetwist.com (at least from February 9, 2021, through February 9, 2023). *Control over Business Decisions*:

- 87. OrangeTwist is the sole and exclusive negotiator with all vendors and other entities for all service, software, and technology contracts, and the purchase and/or lease of equipment, supplies, and materials that are necessary for the operation of Practice. Goods and services are provided to BCOT1 by "persons affiliated with Manager." (Appendix B, paragraph (g).)
- 88. When negotiating with vendors and other entities, Manager may receive discounts that it is not required to pass on to BCOT1. In addition, Manager "may add a reasonable markup to the cost of goods and services obtained for Practice. (Appendix B, paragraph (g).)
- 89. Despite the Practice having the ultimate authority to settle all matters and direct the prosecution of such claims, the control of the litigation remains with the Manager rather than the providers operating under BCOT1, the professional corporation.

t s successor as CEO of BCO 11, 33, M.D

98. OrangeTwist retained control over billing and collecting the charges, how accounts would be settled in the event of disputes, and the determination of which charges to write off.

Subject to Practice's oversight and ultimate authority, Manager will be responsible, for and on behalf of Practice, as its agent, for billing and collecting the charges made with respect to all medical services provided by Practice at the Practice unless otherwise agreed in writing. The extent to which Manager attempts to collect such charges, the methods of collection and the amount of settlements with respect to disputed charges, and the determination of which charges are not collectible, will be determined by Manager. ... (Appendix B, paragraph (b).)

- 99. OrangeTwist's exclusive special power of attorney also gave it the right to initiate legal proceedings in the name of Practice to collect monies owed to Practice, to enforce the rights of Practice as creditor under any contract or in connection with the rendering of any service, and to contest adjustments and denials by governmental agencies as third-party payors. (Appendix D, article 1.02(h).)
- 100. OrangeTwist controls the bookkeeping and accounting of the practice and the business records belong to OrangeTwist.<sup>23</sup>

Manager will provide all bookkeeping and accounting services necessary or appropriate to the functioning of the Practice including maintenance, custody, and supervision of all Business Records. Manager will use reasonable efforts to preserve the confidentiality of patient medical records and use information contained in these records only for the limited purposes necessary to perform the services set forth in this Agreement. All Business Records are the property of Manager. Upon expiration or termination of this [2019 MSA], Practice will retain all patient medical records and patient files maintained by Practice. (Appendix B, paragraph (a))

# Control over Salaries and Personnel

101. OrangeTwist has a say in BCOT's hiring of professional medical employees.

Practice will have final authority for the hiring, supervision, evaluation and termination of its Practice Professionals (in consultation with Manager). Manager will consult with and assist Practice in identifying, prequalifying, and recruiting new Practice Professionals. (Article 2.03.)

102. The medical providers who perform medical treatments at OrangeTwist locations (not the medical directors) are not employed, paid, and/or supervised by BCOT1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> At the Board interview, Respondent had no knowledge of any of the finances or bookkeeping of BCOT1. He was unaware that the 2019 MSA made provision for a management fee to be paid by BCOT1 to OrangeTwist.

- 103. OrangeTwist has input regarding and/or *de facto* complete control over professional
- (a) The terms of the 2019 MSA provide that medical directors are paid \$1,500 per month, per location and, further, "Upon request, Manager will provide research and analysis regarding fees for Professional Services rendered by Practice's Practice Professionals." (Article 2.01(b).)
- (b) When interviewed by the Board, Respondent stated that he had no control over the medical directors' salaries and that this control rested completely with OrangeTwist. Even though he regarded the medical directors' and Chief Medical Director's salaries as too low, he had no authority to increase it.
- (c) As OrangeTwist grew and acquired more locations, Respondent intended to "sit down with the company" and say that the salary was not enough for this increased level of oversight, from six (6) locations to fourteen (14).
- 104. The 2019 MSA requires BCOT1 to adopt personnel policies and procedures that are consistent with OrangeTwist's policies and procedures. (Appendix B, clause (d).)
- 105. Per the terms of the 2019 MSA, BCOT1 agreed that it would "require all Practice Professionals to execute and deliver to Manager powers of attorney, satisfactory in form and substance to Manager, appointing Manager as attorney-in-fact for each of the purposes set forth in this Agreement." (Article 2.05.)

### Fee Splitting

- 106. As OrangeTwist's "management fee," BCOT1 was required to pay (i) \$45,750 per month plus (ii) 12% of the amount by which Practice Revenue for the month exceeds \$200,000. (Appendix A, paragraph (m).)
- 107. For its (compelled) use of the OrangeTwist trademark, BCOT1 was required to pay OrangeTwist a monthly "royalty equal to 20% of Practice Revenues." (Schedule B(M), Article 1.06.)

# Supervision of Medical Procedures Performed at OrangeTwist locations

108. As the supervising physician for medical directors, it was Respondent's responsibility to ensure that the medical directors were providing appropriate patient care.

- 109. At the Board interview, Respondent stated that he saw his role as Chief Medical Officer as an "ambassador position."
- 110. Respondent's corporation signed agreements with medical directors who would provide medical services under the terms of BCOT1's medical director contracts. But the medical directors provided oversight at locations using the OrangeTwist brand. No medical care was provided by "Body Concepts by Orange Twist 1 Corp."
- autonomy in the oversight and running of their center," and the "only thing that they had to be was always available." There was no requirement of how often (or how much time) they needed to be physically at 'their' OrangeTwist location(s). One of the medical directors was contracted to supervise two OrangeTwist locations, one in northern California and the other in Las Vegas. All the medical directors supervise more than one location.
- 112. In Board interviews with the medical directors, it was clear that they typically spend very little time physically at their centers. In some instances, their physical visits to the centers could be as seldom as once a month or one every two months.
  - 113. Some procedures performed at OrangeTwist can lead to adverse outcomes.
- 114. Patients at OrangeTwist were required to have a good faith exam performed before undergoing any treatment or a procedure by a physician, nurse practitioner, or physician assistant.
- 115. On or about March 4, 2019, OrangeTwist engaged the services of a telehealth company (a professional medical corporation) as an independent contractor to provide persons who would perform good faith exams at OrangeTwist.
- 116. When no physician assistant or nurse practitioner is available at OrangeTwist, they reportedly use providers employed by the telehealth company to perform the required good faith exams. The telehealth company has no contractual obligation to BCOT1.
- 117. It is not clear that patients were aware that some care (such as good faith examinations) was provided by the telehealth company (contracted by OrangeTwist), while other care was provided by BCOT1 via physician extenders with BCOT1 medical director oversight.

118. It is further not clear that all the BCOT1 medical directors observed whether these the medical procedures were performed appropriately by the physician extenders.

# Respondent, OrangeTwist FNP and Respondent's Exit From BCOT1:

- 119. At the Board interview, Respondent described OrangeTwist as "the parent organization," of which he had functioned as a medical director "and their chief medical director." Respondent continued, "OrangeTwist is a lay corporation, and they needed a medical corporation to oversee the direct medical care."
- 120. In February 2020, Respondent became ill and was unable to fulfill his duties as medical director or chief medical director. He informed "the OrangeTwist folks," who asked him if he would "allow [them] the time to find somebody to be the new VP chief medical director [his replacement]..."
- 121. OrangeTwist convened a panel of three OrangeTwist medical directors and asked them to select the new Chief Medical Director and CEO of BCOT1. The panel selected JS, M.D.
- 122. Around the end of May 2020, Respondent purportedly transferred his 10,000 shares in BCOT1 to JS, M.D., for the reported price of ten dollars (\$10) <sup>24</sup>, thereby making JS, M.D., the CEO of BCOT1. The transaction was marked by a Stock Purchase Agreement, purportedly effective May 20, 2020, but signed by Respondent on May 28, 2020, and by JS, M.D., on June 3, 2020.
- 123. On or about May 20, 2020, JS, M.D., succeeded Respondent as CEO of BCOT1 and Chief Medical Director of OrangeTwist under the 2019 MSA.
- 124. Effective March 1, 2021, ownership of BCOT1 was transferred from JS, M.D., to TP, M.D. (former owner of Pure Aesthetics medical corporation), for the nominal price of ten dollars (\$10), although no money changed hands.
- 125. Respondent never applied for, and never obtained, an OrangeTwist FNP.

As he explained, the medical corporation (BCOT1) was "just the vehicle that they had set up that was necessary to fulfill that role [of overseeing the direct medical care]. There was no financial advantage to buying it or selling it."

126. This notwithstanding, on or about March 25, 2021, Dr. Palmer filed an application with the Board for the cancellation of FNP 547154 (issued to Dr. Stevens as the owner of BCOT1 in April 2017).

127. In April 2021, on www.orangetwist.com, Respondent was still listed as the medical director of the South Bay OrangeTwist location (El Segundo).

# FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Aiding and Abetting the Unlicensed Practice of Medicine)

128. Respondent is subject to disciplinary action under sections 2227 and 2234 of the Code, as defined by sections 2052, subdivision (b), 2264, 2234, subdivision (a), 2400, and 2410, of the Code, in that he aided and abetted the unlicensed practice of medicine by OrangeTwist, LLC, by entering into an agreement with and/or allowing a lay to exert authority and/or control over his medical practice, Body Concepts of Orange Twist 1 Corp, and/or as more particularly alleged in paragraphs 28 through 127, above, which are hereby realleged and incorporated by this reference as if fully set forth herein.

# SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Violation of the Corporate Practice of Medicine Ban)

129. Respondent is further subject to disciplinary action under sections 2227 and 2234 of the Code, as defined by sections 2234, subdivision (a), 2286, 2400, 2402, 2406, and 2410, of the Code, Corporations Code sections 13401 and 13408.5, and California Code of Regulations, title 16, sections 1343 and 1347, in that he violated, directly or indirectly, and/or assisted in or abetted the violation of, the Moscone-Knox Professional Corporation Act and/or the ban on the corporate practice of medicine, by entering into an agreement with and/or allowing a lay corporation to exert authority and/or control over his medical practice, Body Concepts of Orange Twist 1 Corp, and/or as more particularly alleged in paragraphs 28 through 127, above, which are hereby realleged and incorporated by this reference as if fully set forth herein.

27 ////

28 ////

# THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Offering of Unearned Rebate)

130. Respondent is further subject to disciplinary action under sections 2227 and 2234 of the Code, as defined by section 650 of the Code, in that he offered and/or delivered a rebate, refund, commission, preference, patronage dividend, discount, or other consideration as compensation or inducement for referring patients, clients, or customers to his practice, as more particularly alleged in paragraphs 28 through 127, above, which are hereby realleged and incorporated by this reference as if fully set forth herein.

# FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Use of a Fictitious Name Without A Fictitious Name Permit)

131. Respondent is further subject to disciplinary action under sections 2227 and 2234 of the Code, as defined by sections 2285, 2415, and 2410, of the Code and California Code of Regulations, title 16, sections 1344, 1347, and 1350, in that he practiced medicine under the name OrangeTwist and/or Body Concepts by Orange Twist 1 Corp., without a fictitious name permit obtained pursuant to Section 2415, as more particularly alleged in paragraphs 28 through 127, above, which are hereby realleged and incorporated by this reference as if fully set forth herein.

# FIFTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (General Unprofessional Conduct)

132. Respondent is further subject to disciplinary action under sections 2234 and 2410 of the Code, sections 13410 and 13408.5 of the Corporations Code, and the AMA Code of Ethics, in that he has engaged in conduct which breaches the rules or ethical code of the medical profession, or conduct that is unbecoming to a member in good standing of the medical profession, and which demonstrates an unfitness to practice medicine, as more particularly alleged in paragraphs 28 through 131, above, which are hereby realleged and incorporated by this reference as if fully set forth herein.

# **PRAYER**

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Medical Board of California issue a decision: