# BEFORE THE MEDICAL BOARD OF CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS STATE OF CALIFORNIA

In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	
Martin Charles Nation, M.D.	Case No. 800-2019-052595
Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036	
Respondent.	
DECISION	
The attached Stipulated Surrender of Lice is hereby adopted as the Decision and Order of California, Department of Consumer Affairs, Sta  This Decision shall become effective at 5:  NOV 1.2 2021  IT IS SO ORDERED	the Medical Board of te of California. NOV 1.9 2021
MEDICAL MEDICAL	BOARD OF CALIFORNIA
William Pr	,
Executive	Director

.				
1	ROB BONTA		· ·	
2	Attorney General of California MATTHEW M. DAVIS			
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General LEANNA E. SHIELDS		~	
4	Deputy Attorney General- State Bar No. 239872			
5	600 West Broadway, Suite 1800 San Diego, CA 92101		*	
6	P.O. Box 85266 San Diego, CA 92186-5266			
7	Telephone: (619) 738-9401 Facsimile: (619) 645-2061		. /	
8	Attorneys for Complainant			
9				
10	BEFOR			
11	MEDICAL BOARD OF CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS			
12	STATE OF CALIFORNIA			
13	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 800-2019-052595		
14	MARTIN CHARLES NATION, M.D. 1123 W. Struck Avenue	STIPULATED SURRENDER C LICENSE AND DISCIPLINAR	)F Y ORDEŘ	
15	Orange, CA 92867		<u> </u>	
16	Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036,		·	
17	Respondent.			
18		]		
19	,	• .		
20	IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGR	EED by and between the parties to	the above-	
21	entitled proceedings that the following matters are true:			
22	PAR	<u>ries</u>		
23	1. William Prasifka (Complainant) is the Executive Director of the Medical Board of			
24	California (Board). He brought this action solely in his official capacity and is represented in thi			
25	matter by Rob Bonta, Attorney General of the State of California, by LeAnna E. Shields, Deputy			
26	Attorney General.			
27	2. Martin Charles Nation, M.D. (Respo	2. Martin Charles Nation, M.D. (Respondent) is represented in this proceeding by		
28	attorneys Peter R. Osinoff, Esq., and Carolyn W.	Lindholm, Esq., with Bonne, Bridg	es, Mueller,	
	,			

O'Keefe & Nichols, whose address is: 355 South Grand Avenue, Suite 1750, Los Angeles, CA 90071.

3. On or about January 12, 1981, the Board issued Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036 to Respondent. The Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate was in full force and effect at all times relevant to the charges brought in Accusation No. 800-2019-052595 and will expire on June 30, 2022, unless renewed.

### **JURISDICTION**

4. On September 15, 2021, Accusation No. 800-2019-052595 was filed before the Board, and is currently pending against Respondent. A true and correct copy of Accusation No. 800-2019-052595 and all other statutorily required documents were properly served on Respondent on September 15, 2021. Respondent timely filed his Notice of Defense contesting the Accusation. A true and correct copy of Accusation No. 800-2019-052595 is attached hereto as Exhibit A and incorporated by reference as if fully set forth herein.

# ADVISEMENT AND WAIVERS

- 5. Respondent has carefully read, fully discussed with counsel, and fully understands the charges and allegations in Accusation No. 800-2019-052595. Respondent also has carefully read, fully discussed with counsel, and fully understands the effects of this Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order.
- 6. Respondent is fully aware of his legal rights in this matter, including the right to a hearing on the charges and allegations in the Accusation; the right to confront and cross-examine the witnesses against him; the right to present evidence and to testify on his own behalf; the right to the issuance of subpoenas to compel the attendance of witnesses and the production of documents; the right to reconsideration and court review of an adverse decision; and all other rights accorded by the California Administrative Procedure Act and other applicable laws.
- 7. Having the benefit of counsel, Respondent voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently waives and gives up each and every right set forth above.

|| ///

///

#### **CULPABILITY**

- 8. Respondent does not contest that, at an administrative hearing, Complainant could establish a *prima facie* case with respect to each and every charge and allegation contained in Accusation No. 800-2019-052595, agrees that he has thereby subjected his Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036 to disciplinary action, and hereby surrenders his Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036 for the Board's formal acceptance.
- 9. Respondent agrees that if he files a petition for reinstatement or relicensure, or an accusation and/or petition to revoke probation is filed against him before the Medical Board of California, all of the charges and allegations contained in Accusation No. 800-2019-052595 shall be deemed true, correct, and fully admitted by Respondent for purposes of any such proceeding or any other licensing proceeding involving Respondent in the State of California.
- 10. Respondent understands that by signing this stipulation he enables the Board to issue an order accepting the surrender of his Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036 without notice to, or opportunity to be heard by, Respondent.

### **CONTINGENCY**

- 11. Business and Professions Code section 2224, subdivision (b), provides, in pertinent part, that the Medical Board "shall delegate to its executive director the authority to adopt a ... stipulation for surrender of a license."
- 12. Respondent understands that, by signing this stipulation, he enables the Executive Director of the Board to issue an order, on behalf of the Board, accepting the surrender of his Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036, without further notice to, or opportunity to be heard by, Respondent.
- 13. This Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order shall be subject to the approval of the Executive Director on behalf of the Board. The parties agree that this Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order shall be submitted to the Executive Director for his consideration in the above-entitled matter and, further, that the Executive Director shall have a reasonable period of time in which to consider and act on this Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order after receiving it. By signing this stipulation, Respondent fully understands

10

11 12

13

14

15 16

17

18

19

20

21

22

2324

26

25

27

28

and agrees that he may not withdraw his agreement or seek to rescind this stipulation prior to the time the Executive Director, on behalf of the Medical Board, considers and acts upon it.

The parties agree that this Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order 14. shall be null and void and not binding upon the parties unless approved and adopted by the Executive Director on behalf of the Board, except for this paragraph, which shall remain in full force and effect. Respondent fully understands and agrees that in deciding whether or not to approve and adopt this Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order, the Executive Director and/or the Board may receive oral and written communications from its staff and/or the Attorney General's Office. Communications pursuant to this paragraph shall not disqualify the Executive Director, the Board, any member thereof, and/or any other person from future participation in this or any other matter affecting or involving Respondent. In the event that the Executive Director on behalf of the Board does not, in his discretion, approve and adopt this Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order, with the exception of this paragraph, it shall not become effective, shall be of no evidentiary value whatsoever, and shall not be relied upon or introduced in any disciplinary action by either party hereto. Respondent further agrees that should this Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order be rejected for any reason by the Executive Director on behalf of the Board, Respondent will assert no claim that the Executive Director, the Board, or any member thereof, was prejudiced by its/his/her review, discussion and/or consideration of this Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order or of any matter or matters related hereto.

## ADDITIONAL PROVISIONS

- 15. This Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order is intended by the parties herein to be an integrated writing representing the complete, final and exclusive embodiment of the agreements of the parties in the above-entitled matter.
- 16. The parties agree that copies of this Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order, including copies of the signatures of the parties, may be used in lieu of original documents and signatures and, further, that such copies shall have the same force and effect as originals.

///

17. In consideration of the foregoing admissions and stipulations, the parties agree the Executive Director of the Board may, without further notice to or opportunity to be heard by Respondent, issue and enter the following Disciplinary Order on behalf of the Board:

#### **ORDER**

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036, issued to Respondent MARTIN CHARLES NATION, M.D., is hereby surrendered and accepted by the Medical Board of California.

- 1. The surrender of Respondent's Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036, and the acceptance of the surrendered license by the Board shall constitute the imposition of discipline against Respondent. This stipulation constitutes a record of the discipline and shall become a part of Respondent's license history with the Board.
- 2. Respondent shall lose all rights and privileges as a physician and surgeon in California as of the effective date of the Board's Decision and Order.
- 3. Respondent shall cause to be delivered to the Board his pocket license and, if one was issued, his wall certificate on or before the effective date of the Decision and Order.
- 4. If Respondent ever files an application for licensure or a petition for reinstatement in the State of California, the Board shall treat it as a petition for reinstatement. Respondent must comply with all the laws, regulations and procedures for reinstatement of a revoked or surrendered license in effect at the time the petition is filed, and all of the charges and allegations contained in Accusation No. 800-2019-052595 shall be deemed to be true, correct and fully admitted by Respondent when the Board determines whether to grant or deny the petition.
- 5. If Respondent should ever apply or reapply for a new license or certification, or petition for reinstatement of a license, by any other health care licensing agency in the State of California, all of the charges and allegations contained in Accusation, No. 800-2019-052595 shall be deemed to be true, correct, and fully admitted by Respondent for the purpose of any Statement of Issues or any other proceeding seeking to deny or restrict licensure.

28 | ///

///

# **ACCEPTANCE** I have carefully read the above Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order and have fully discussed it with my attorneys, Peter R. Osinoff, Esq., and Carolyn W. Lindholm, Esq. I fully understand the stipulation and the effect it will have on my Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036. I enter into this Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order voluntarily, knowingly, and intelligently, and agree to be bound by the Decision and Order of the Medical Board of California. MARTIN CHARLES NATION, M.D. Respondent I have read and fully discussed with Respondent Martin Charles Nation, M.D. the terms and conditions and other matters contained in this Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order. I approve its form and content. PETER R. OSINOFF, ESQ. CAROLYN W. LINDHOLM, ESQ. Attorneys for Respondent **ENDORSEMENT** The foregoing Stipulated Surrender of License and Disciplinary Order is hereby respectfully submitted for consideration by the Medical Board of California of the Department of Consumer Affairs. Nov. 3, 2021 Respectfully submitted. DATED: **ROB BONTA** Attorney General of California MATTHEW M. DAVIS Supervising Deputy Attorney General LEANNA E. SHIELDS Deputy Attorney General Attorneys for Complainant

SD2021801374/83082505.docx

2

3

5

6

8

10

11

12 13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

6

# Exhibit A

Accusation No. 800-2019-052595

1	ROB BONTA	$\ell$ .	
2	Attorney General of California MATTHEW M. DAVIS		
3	Supervising Deputy Attorney General LEANNA E, SHIELDS		
4	Deputy Attorney General State Bar No. 239872		
5	600 West Broadway, Suite 1800 San Diego, CA 92101		
6	P.O. Box 85266 San Diego, CA 92186-5266		
7	Telephone: (619) 738-9401 Facsimile: (619) 645-2061		
8	Attorneys for Complainant		
9			
10		FORE THE	
11	MEDICAL BOARD OF CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF CONSUMER AFFAIRS		
12		OF CALIFORNIA	
13	In the Matter of the Accusation Against:	Case No. 800-2019-052595	
14	MARTIN CHARLES NATION, M.D. 1123 W. Struck Avenue	ACCUSATION	
15	Orange, CA 92867		
16	Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036,		
17	Respond	lent .	
18			
19		•	
20	Complainant alleges:		
21	, <u>I</u>	PARTIES	
22	1. William Prasifka (Complainant)	1. William Prasifka (Complainant) brings this Accusation solely in his official capacity	
23	as the Executive Director of the Medical Box	as the Executive Director of the Medical Board of California, Department of Consumer Affairs	
24	(Board).		
25	2. On or about January 12, 1981, the	ne Medical Board issued Physician's and Surgeon's	
26	Certificate No. G 44036 to Martin Charles Nation, M.D. (Respondent). The Physician's and		
27	Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036 was in fi	all force and effect at all times relevant to the charges	
28	brought herein and will expire on June 30, 2	022, unless renewed.	
		1	
	(MARTIN CHAR	RLES NATION, M.D.) ACCUSATION NO. 800-2019-052595	

11 12

13

14 15

16

17

18

19

20

2122

2324

25

2627

28

| ///

3. This Accusation is brought before the Board, under the authority of the following laws. All section references are to the Business and Professions Code (Code) unless otherwise indicated.

- 4. Section 2227 of the Code states:
- (a) A licensee whose matter has been heard by an administrative law judge of the Medical Quality Hearing Panel as designated in Section 11371 of the Government Code, or whose default has been entered, and who is found guilty, or who has entered into a stipulation for disciplinary action with the board, may, in accordance with the provisions of this chapter:
  - (1) Have his or her license revoked upon order of the board.
- (2) Have his or her right to practice suspended for a period not to exceed one year upon order of the board.
- (3) Be placed on probation and be required to pay the costs of probation monitoring upon order of the board.
- (4) Be publicly reprimanded by the board. The public reprimand may include a requirement that the licensee complete relevant educational courses approved by the board.
- (5) Have any other action taken in relation to discipline as part of an order of probation, as the board or an administrative law judge may deem proper.
- (b) Any matter heard pursuant to subdivision (a), except for warning letters, medical review or advisory conferences, professional competency examinations, continuing education activities, and cost reimbursement associated therewith that are agreed to with the board and successfully completed by the licensee, or other matters made confidential or privileged by existing law, is deemed public, and shall be made available to the public by the board pursuant to Section 803.1.
- 5. Section 2234 of the Code, states, in pertinent part:

The board shall take action against any licensee who is charged with unprofessional conduct. In addition to other provisions of this article, unprofessional conduct includes, but is not limited to, the following:

- (a) Violating or attempting to violate, directly or indirectly, assisting in or abetting the violation of, or conspiring to violate any provision of this chapter.
  - (b) Gross negligence.
- (c) Repeated negligent acts. To be repeated, there must be two or more negligent acts or omissions. An initial negligent act or omission followed by a separate and distinct departure from the applicable standard of care shall constitute repeated negligent acts.

- (1) An initial negligent diagnosis followed by an act or omission medically appropriate for that negligent diagnosis of the patient shall constitute a single negligent act.
- (2) When the standard of care requires a change in the diagnosis, act, or omission that constitutes the negligent act described in paragraph (1), including, but not limited to, a reevaluation of the diagnosis or a change in treatment, and the licensee's conduct departs from the applicable standard of care, each departure constitutes a separate and distinct breach of the standard of care.
- 6. Section 2415 of the Code states, in pertinent part:
- (a) Any physician and surgeon or any doctor of podiatric medicine, as the case may be, who as a sole proprietor, or in a partnership, group, or professional corporation, desires to practice under any name that would otherwise be a violation of Section 2285 may practice under that name if the proprietor, partnership, group, or corporation obtains and maintains in current status a fictitious-name permit issued by the Division of Licensing, or, in the case of doctors of podiatric medicine, the California Board of Podiatric Medicine, under the provisions of this section.
- 7. Unprofessional conduct under section 2234 of the Code is conduct which breaches the rules or ethical code of the medical profession, or conduct which is unbecoming to a member in good standing of the medical profession, and which demonstrates an unfitness to practice medicine. (Shea v. Board of Medical Examiners (1978) 81 Cal.App.3d 564, 575.)

#### FACTUAL ALLEGATIONS

- 8. On or about December 6, 2012, the Medical Board of California issued Fictitious Name Permit (FNP) No. 43596 to Flawless Med Spa (FMS), identifying Respondent as president and owner of the business.
  - 9. On or about December 31, 2016, the FNP No. 43596 expired and was not renewed.
- 10. According to FMS operational policies and procedures, Respondent was the sole physician and medical director of FMS. Respondent was responsible for supervising procedures performed by FMS staff, including, but not limited to, registered nurses and nurse practitioners.
- 11. On or about December 17, 2020, during an interview with investigators with the Division of Investigation, Respondent indicated he was Board certified in orthopedic surgery. Respondent admitted having no formal training or certifications in the treatments provided by FMS, including, but not limited to, laser treatments, facial injections, photo facials, and cool

sculpting. Respondent indicated he purchased a comprehensive textbook about dermatologic surgery when he began working with FMS.

12. During his interview with investigators, Respondent also indicated he only visited FMS once a month to review records. When asked about specific operations at FMS, Respondent could not clearly specify how many employees were on staff at FMS, who arranged staffing schedules, or the identities of the staff and their credentials. Respondent also admitted he was not actively involved in hiring FMS staff, but was merely introduced to them upon hiring. Respondent also could not identify who was the other listed owner on the corporation documents, who issued his paychecks, and indicated he did not have keys to FMS.

#### Patient Al

- 13. On or about October 20, 2017, Patient A, a then 40-year-old female, presented at FMS seeking to improve her facial skin appearance, including, but not limited to, reduction of fine lines, wrinkles, and dark spots.
- 14. According to records, Patient A underwent a good faith examination, however, records for the good faith examination are not dated or signed by Respondent or any other staff member at FMS.
- 15. At no time prior to treatment at FMS did Respondent discuss the risks, indicate a diagnosis, or discuss a plan of treatment with Patient A.
- 16. On or about October 20, 2017, through on or about February 2, 2019, Patient A received facial injections at FMS by a staff nurse on approximately four (4) separate occasions, including, but not limited to, October 10, 2017; February 2, 2018; June 1, 2018; and October 5, 2018. Records for these visits indicate the injections were performed by an FMS registered nurse. Records for these treatments are not signed by Respondent.
- 17. On or about October 20, 2017, through on or about February 2, 2019, Patient A received Intense Pulsed Light (IPL) treatment at FMS by a staff nurse on approximately nine (9) separate occasions, including, but not limited to, December 9, 2017; February 2, 2018; March 6,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> To protect the privacy of patients involved, patient names have not been included in this pleading. Respondent is aware of the identity of the patients referred to herein.

2018; April 6, 2018; June 1, 2018; September 21, 2018; October 19, 2018; November 2018; and February 2, 2019. Records for these visits indicate the IPL treatment was performed by an FMS registered nurse. Records for these treatments are not signed by Respondent.

- 18. On or about February 2, 2019, after Patient A's IPL treatment at FMS, Patient A's skin displayed burn marks and scabbing.
- 19. On or about February 6, 2019, Patient A was seen by Respondent. According to records, Respondent noted scabbing on Patient A's forehead and cheeks as a result of Patient A's IPL treatment on February 2, 2019. Respondent determined Patient A suffered first or second degree burns, prescribed ointment medication, and scheduled a follow-up visit.

#### Patient B

- 20. On or about October 3, 2019, an undercover investigator (UI) with the Division of Investigation, Health Quality Investigation Unit (HQIU), posed as a potential patient and presented at FMS under the guise of seeking to improve his facial skin appearance, including, but not limited to, reduction of wrinkles.
- 21. During his consultation, the UI completed initial patient intake forms and met with an FMS staff nurse who explained the treatments and procedures to the UI and used a pen to draw on the UI's face to indicate the treatment areas. The FMS staff nurse informed the UI that his initial treatment would consist of approximately 54 units of Botox.
- 22. The FMS staff nurse then escorted the UI into a room with an iPad where the UI met with Respondent by videoconference. Respondent inquired as to the UI's medical history and indicated the FMS staff nurse would perform the treatments. At no time did Respondent state a diagnosis, describe a treatment plan, or discuss the FMS staff nurse's Botox assessment. According to records, Respondent cleared the UI for various treatments to be provided by the FMS staff nurse, including, but not limited to, Botulinum Toxin A (Botox) injections and hyaluronic acid dermal fillers.

///

27 | ///

28 | ///

#### FIRST CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

#### (Gross Negligence)

- 23. Respondent has subjected his Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036 to disciplinary action under sections 2227 and 2234, as defined by section 2234, subdivision (b), of the Code; in that he, as owner and medical director of FMS, committed gross negligence in the care and treatment of Patients A and B, as more particularly alleged hereinafter.
  - A. Paragraphs 8 through 22, above, are hereby incorporated by reference and realleged as if fully set forth herein;
  - B. Respondent maintained a supervisory role in medical procedures in which Respondent had no formal training, appropriate knowledge, competence, and/or experience, including, but not limited to, dermatologic and/or cosmetic procedures such as IPL, facial injections, and dermal fillers;
  - C. Respondent failed to actively supervise FMS staff in the provision of medical services to patients, including, but not limited to, Patients A and B, in that he failed to obtain informed consent, determine a diagnosis, prepare a written treatment plan, supervise the provision of treatment services, and/or maintain patient records; and
  - D. Respondent failed to maintain appropriate responsibilities and duties as owner of FMS.

# SECOND CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

### (Repeated Negligent Acts)

- 24. Respondent has further subjected his Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036 to disciplinary action under sections 2227 and 2234, as defined by section 2234, subdivision (c), of the Code, in that he, as owner and medical director of FMS, committed repeated negligent acts in the care and treatment of Patients A and B, as more particularly alleged hereinafter.
  - A. Paragraphs 8 through 23, above, are hereby incorporated by reference and realleged as if fully set forth herein;

- B. Respondent failed to properly document his performance of a good faith examination of Patients A and B; and
- C. Respondent failed to ensure the proper administration of IPL by FMS staff on Patient A.

#### THIRD CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (Failure to Maintain a Current Fictitious Name Permit)

25. Respondent has further subjected his Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036 to disciplinary action under sections 2227 and 2234, as defined by section 2234, subdivision (a), and 2415, subdivision (a), of the Code, in that he failed to maintain a current fictitious-name permit with the Medical Board of California, as more particularly alleged in paragraphs 8 through 12, above, which are hereby incorporated by reference and realleged as if fully set forth herein.

#### FOURTH CAUSE FOR DISCIPLINE

# (General Unprofessional Conduct)

26. Respondent has further subjected his Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036 to disciplinary action under sections 2227 and 2234, of the Code, in that Respondent engaged in conduct which breached the rules or ethical code of the medical profession or which was unbecoming of a member in good standing of the medical profession, and which demonstrates an unfitness to practice medicine, in his care and treatment of Patients A and B, as more particularly alleged in paragraphs 8 through 25, above, which are hereby incorporated by reference and realleged as if fully set forth herein.

#### PRAYER

WHEREFORE, Complainant requests that a hearing be held on the matters herein alleged, and that following the hearing, the Medical Board of California issue a decision:

- 1. Revoking or suspending Physician's and Surgeon's Certificate No. G 44036, issued to Respondent Martin Charles Nation, M.D.;
- 2. Revoking, suspending or denying approval of Respondent Martin Charles Nation, M.D.'s authority to supervise physician assistants and advanced practice nurses;

	Oudantiis Desmanders Ma	ustin Chaulag Nation M.D. if placed an application to neverthe	
1		rtin Charles Nation, M.D., if placed on probation, to pay the	
2	Board the costs of probation monitoring; and		
3	4. Taking such other and fu	rther action as deemed necessary and proper.	
4	SEP 1 5 2021	and M	
5	DATED:	WILLIAM PRASIFKA	
6		Executive Director Medical Board of California	
7		Department of Consumer Affairs State of California	
8	, ,	Complainant	
9			
.10	SD2021801374		
11	82970102.docx		
12			
13			
14			
15	,		
16			
17			
18			
19	,		
20	·		
21		•	
22			
23			
24			
25			
26			
27		•	
. 28			
		8	
	(MART	IN CHARLES NATION, M.D.) ACCUSATION NO. 800-2019-052595	